Stefan Beyerle

"Many of those who sleep in the land of dust shall awake!" (Dan 12:2)

Towards a Matrix of Apocalyptic Eschatology in Ancient Judaism

1 "Apocalyptic Eschatology" in Time and Space

In his early novel *In the Country of Last Things* the American author Paul Auster introduces the female protagonist Anna Blume as a writer of a letter that retells all things that happened to her in order to protect these things from being lost and forgotten. By means of a somewhat paradoxical contrast, all things, experiences, events and acquaintances of the protagonist that are documented in this letter are designed to vanish in the haze within an "apocalyptic reality." The letter – that is represented by the whole of Auster's novel – includes Anna Blume's ambition to seek order. But even this desire remains unfulfilled: "Faced with the most ordinary occurrence, you no longer know how to act, and because you cannot act, you find yourself unable to think. The brain is muddle. All around you one change follows another, each day produces a new upheaval, the old assumptions are so much air and emptiness."

The focus in the quoted passage can be found in the last sentence, wherein the "old assumptions are so much air and emptiness." Not only place and time, but also thoughts, what remains beyond every "thing," are in danger to disappear forever. Despite Paul Auster himself explicitly denying that his book deals with the future or any kind of science fiction, most interpreters call *In the Country of Last Things* a dystopian epistolary novel.² Be that as it may, Anna's world is out of order. She starts her letter with the following words: "These are the last things. A house is there one day, and the next day it is

¹ Paul Auster, *In the Country of Last Things* (New York: Penguin, 1987), 20. Obviously, Auster uses the name "Anna Blume" with reference to the poem "To Anna Blume," written by Kurt Schwitters (I thank Michael Wolter for this hint). Consequently, the name points to a non-existing person that lives "in disappearance".

² Cf. the discussion in Matti Hyvärinen, "Acting, Thinking, and Telling: Anna Blume's Dilemma in Paul Auster's *In the Country of Last Things*," *Partial Answers* 4/2 (2006): 3–5.

gone. A street you walked down yesterday is no longer there today. Even the weather is in constant flux."³

Constant disappearance characterizes the "Country of Last Things," and especially *topical* disorder evokes a world-view that in general can be called "apocalyptic." With regards to this disorder, untidiness or chaos, the novel constructs a reality that can be called in its best sense "u-topian." Beyond this topical orientation there is also a temporal or chronological level that is apparent, at the latest, when the reader comes to the end of the novel. Here, Anna Blume's diary ends with the following sentences: "Once we get to where we are going, I will try to write to you again, I promise."

In Paul Auster's novel the future is untold as the protagonist's past is lost. Nevertheless, the finishing parts of the novel emphasize a future orientation. Consequently, time and space – in their specific settings – constitute Auster's understanding of the "Country of Last Things." The role of time and space is embedded in an "apocalyptic" world-view that reflects a "mythic" and also "mystic" re-interpretation of the real world. As can be concluded from most of the other novels of Paul Auster, the "mystical" aspect is much more apparent in the plots of his stories.⁵

On the other hand, "apocalypses" rather tend to reflect a "mythical" view about time and space, e.g., in their use of *Urzeit-Endzeit* schemes, how they reflect on "creation" and "new creation" (cf. *4 Ezra*, *2 Bar.*), in the "apocalypses" use of "binitarian models" when the divine is conceptualized (cf. Dan 7:13–14) or in the way a heavenly temple (cf. *1 En*. 14) is imagined. All in all, for a better understanding of what is meant by the term "apocalyptic eschatology," a further examination of "time" and "space" is helpful.

³ Auster, Country, 1.

⁴ Auster, *Country*, 188. Hyvärinen, "Acting", 17, comments on this passage: "In fully admitting the radical openness of her future, Anna nevertheless reasserts her commitment to being a responsible agent who has a future, who continues to be herself."

⁵ To some extent, the very model of a mystical and Kabala-oriented setting and plot among novels from the modern era represents Franz Werfel's *Star of the Unborn* (New York: Bantam Books), 1976.

⁶ On the world-view of apocalypses see Stefan Beyerle, "The Imagined World of the Apocalypses," in *The Oxford Handbook of Apocalyptic Literature*, ed. John J. Collins (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014): 373 – 87.

2 "History" and the Genre of an "Apocalypse"

Before I discuss the most intriguing examples of "time" and "space" in apocalyptic eschatology, let me first explain what is meant by an "apocalypse," and further, of how historical aspects come into view within this literary genre. In general, it is important to distinguish between the genre of an "apocalypse" and literatures commonly marketed with labels referring to apocalyptic traditions or groups. The following differentiation is at hand: "apocalypse" as a product of literary genre, "apocalypticism" as marking the social identity of a group, e.g., the groups attested in the Dead Sea Scrolls - including a certain worldview – and "apocalyptic eschatology" as articulated in the later prophetic and wisdom writings, also in the Dead Sea Scrolls.8

The literary genre "apocalypse" can only be described but not defined. In his re-evaluation of a definition of the genre, especially with regards to aspects of method and theory, John Collins emphasizes on the one hand: "At the end of the Uppsala conference on apocalypticism, a resolution contra definitionem, pro descriptione was carried. This was not, however, the outcome of systematic discussion: it was simply a diplomatic evasion of the issue at the end of a stimulating but exhausting conference."9

A description, on the other hand, embraces core motifs like the addiction of the whole world to sin and evil. The trajectories that mostly originate from times of crisis articulate hope for a transcendent world that is incomparable to a thisworldly sphere. This incomparability is guaranteed by means of several tools. One of them emerges in the concept of end-time mysteries that are paralleled by divine revelations, culminating most of the times in an eschatological judgment.

By and large, these core motifs constitute similarities that refer to Ludwig Wittgenstein's idea of "family resemblance," and, in fact, all these motifs are

⁷ For the following announcements cf. Stefan Beyerle, "'Remember the Exodus!'- and Related Issues within 'Historical Apocalypses'," in Exodus: Rezeptionen in deuterokanonischer und frühjüdischer Literatur, Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Studies 32, ed. Judith Gärtner and Barbara Schmitz (Berlin-Boston: W. de Gruyter, 2016): 213-15.

⁸ Cf. Paul D. Hanson, "Apocalypses and Apocalypticism," in Anchor Bible Dictionary I:279 – 82. 9 John J. Collins, "Introduction: The Genre Apocalypse Reconsidered," in Apocalypse, Prophecy, and Pseudepigraphy: On Jewish Apocalyptic Literature (Grand Rapids-Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2015), 9 (italics in the text). The above-mentioned conference at Uppsala is documented in Apocalypticism in the Mediterranean World and the Near East: Proceedings of the International Colloquium on Apocalypticism Uppsala, August 12-17, 1979, ed. David Hellholm (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck [1983] 1989²).

not sufficiently significant to define a literary genre – even if Wittgenstein did not refer to literary genres in his example, Consequently, John Collins cannot accept this idea as a basis for his *definition* of the genre "apocalypse." Nevertheless, he still retains the proposed definition of the Semeia group, even though he has to concede that several examples from the "world of the texts" do not fit clearly with any definition. Consequently and concerning the method, Collins refers to the "prototype theory," as it was established in the field of cognitive psychology. He points out that the *Semeia* project "started from a list of apocalypses that were regarded as prototypical, and distinguished between central and peripheral characteristics. The main difference is that prototype theory would refuse to establish a strict boundary between texts that are members of the genre and those that were not. It rather distinguishes between texts that are highly typical and those that are less typical."11

Thus, at least all "less typical" literary examples of an "apocalypse" could only come close to what the definition of the genre requests. What is more, the distinction between "highly typical" and "less typical" implies a hierarchic taxonomy of "genre." Each criterion of this hierarchy is modeled by prerequisites that stem from the modern, post-enlightenment scholarly discussion. In the end, the question of what constitutes a "highly typical" exemplar of the genre can only be answered with the help of sources that already had been classified in terms of form and genre. All in all, the theoretical problems are due to the fact that every approach to the genre "apocalypse" has to take an "etic" point of view. 12 And in the end, the question of description or definition remains undecided. Due to the above-mentioned theoretical and methodological problems, I would still prefer the term description.

Nevertheless, the narrative framework of an "apocalypse" is of genre-specific importance. This framework embraces two different strategies of revelation:

¹⁰ For the idea of "family resemblance" cf. Ludwig Wittgenstein, Philosophical Investigations (Oxford: Blackwell, 1958), 31-32, and for a critical evaluation cf. Collins, "Introduction", 9-11, who states (ibid., 11) that "Family resemblance' is too vague to be satisfactory as a basis for genre recognition [...]."

¹¹ Collins, "Introduction", 13.

¹² Recently, Alexander Kulik, "Genre without a Name: Was There a Hebrew Term for 'Apocalypse'?," JSJ 40 (2009): 540 – 50, argued for hints towards an "emic" position.

¹³ Most of the core motifs - and more - that can be detected in the literary genre of an "apocalypse" were collected and explained by Ina Willi-Plein, "Das Geheimnis der Apokalyptik," VT 27 (1977): 62-81; reprinted in eadem, Sprache als Schlüssel: Gesammelte Aufsätze zum Alten Testament, ed. Michael Pietsch and Tilmann Präckel (Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 2002): 159-76. Two years later, John Collins provided us with a definition of the genre that was originally discussed within the "SBL Semeia-Group" and has found wide acceptance until

the first one is the use of heavenly or cosmological journeys of the protagonists. A second strategy reconstructs history – for instance, "history" of a kind as it also appears in the canonical writings of the Old Testament. Here, I would like to stay away from terms like "Heilsgeschichte" (or the "history of salvation") because of the rather diverging concepts of historical remembrance within the so-called "Historical Apocalypses." Among German speaking scholars, it was a former student of Gerhard von Rad, Günter Reese, who assumed that some of the apocalyptic sources, as, e.g., the Animal Apocalypse (1 En. 85-90), attest to an ongoing tradition of Old Testament "salvation history." ¹⁴ But against this, the concept of "history" in texts like the Apocalypse of Weeks (1 En. 93:1-10; 91:11-17) or the *Animal Apocalypse* is much too cosmologically focused and includes unexpected turns in mode – from a negative to a positive view on "history" and vice versa. 15 In general, the narration, or reshaping, of "history" in Jewish apocalypses to a certain degree participates in the construction of the transcendent world, as it is presented in these apocalypses. As a result, "history" becomes part of divine revelation.

The Book of Daniel is a good case in point. The final vision starts in chapter 10 with the following introduction (v. 1): "In the third year of Cyrus, King of Persia, a word was revealed to Daniel, whose name was called Belteshazzar. And the word was true, and it concerned a great trouble. He understood the word, understanding was his in the vision." What follows, is an epiphany of an angel and the well-known visionary examination of history within the seer's discourse with an angel (Dan 11:2-12:4). This heavenly dialog focuses on the Seleucids and the career of Antiochus IV Epiphanes (cf. 10:20 – 21). Daniel's ability to be a visionary is unique, because the people who were with him did not see (10:7). This is because Daniel is the one who set his mind to gain understanding and to humble himself

nowadays: cf. John J. Collins, The Apocalyptic Imagination: An Introduction to Jewish Apocalyptic Literatures (Grand Rapids-Cambridge: Eerdmans, 19982): 2-11, and his discussion in Collins, "Introduction": 1-20.

¹⁴ Cf. Günter Reese, Die Geschichte Israels in der Auffassung des frühen Judentums: Eine Untersuchung der Tiervision und der Zehnwochenapokalypse des äthiopischen Henochbuches, der Geschichtsdarstellung der Assumptio Mosis und der des 4Esrabuches, Bonner Biblische Beiträge 123 (Berlin-Bodenheim: Philo Verlagsgesellschaft, 1999), esp. 119 – 22.

¹⁵ Cf. Beate Ego, "Vergangenheit im Horizont eschatologischer Hoffnung: Die Tiervision (1 Hen 85-90) als Beispiel apokalyptischer Geschichtskonzeption," Die antike Historiographie und die Anfänge der christlichen Geschichtsschreibung, BZNW 129, ed. Eve-Marie Becker (Berlin-New York: W. de Gruyter, 2005): 171-95, esp. 189-90. For the recent scholarly discussion concerning the theology and history in the Animal Apocalypse cf. Daniel C. Olson, A New Reading of the Animal Apocalypse in 1 Enoch: "All Nations Shall Be Blessed." With a New Translation and Commentary, SVTP 24 (Leiden-Boston: Brill, 2013): 5-13.

before his God (10:12). Consequently, already the setting of the third vision of Daniel paves the way for an understanding of "history" in terms of an endtime *revelation*. ¹⁶

All in all, the meaning of "history" in apocalypses is closely linked with, and in several ways contextualized or embedded in, a mythic end-time scheme.¹⁷

3 Notions of "Time" and "Apocalyptic Eschatology"

Recently, the well-known antagonism of "mythic," i.e., cyclic time and Jewish-Christian "historical," i.e., linear notion of time among the Greeks and Hebrews is challenged. The reason for this can be seen in the way documents from ancient Israel used "mythical" *and* "historical" models of time simultaneously. Several texts in the Hebrew Bible lead to a complex concept of time wherein cyclic models are integrated into a pattern of strictly construed linear "history." E.g., the late summary text of Israel's history in Deut 26:5–9, Gerhard von Rad once upon a time called "*Das kleine geschichtliche* Credo," reminds the reader on the epochs of Exodus and the entering into the promised land. At the same time, the literary framework (Deut 26:1–4, 10–11) informs the reader that the same "historical" text should be used as a quotation within the feast of the first fruits. Consequently, as the feast and its agricultural context presuppose repetition, a cyclic notion of time is concerned as well¹⁸.

With regards to apocalyptic literature and apocalypses, the linearity of a future oriented "historical" concept seems to be predominant. E.g., in the Enochic

¹⁶ All "Historical Apocalypses" coincide in this concern. Therefore, it is highly problematic to reconstruct a historical chronology, e.g., in the Book of Daniel and in the *Animal Apocalypse*, as Daniel Olson has suggested: cf. Daniel C. Olson, "Historical Chronology after the Exile according to *1 Enoch* 89–90," *JSP* 15 (2005): 63–74.

¹⁷ Nevertheless, a simple juxtaposition of "history" in prophetic eschatology and "myth" in apocalyptic eschatology finds no proof in the sources: cf. Lorenzo DiTommaso, "History and Apocalyptic Eschatology: A Reply to J.Y. Jindo," VT 56 (2006): 413–18, who rejects the thesis of Job Y. Jindo, "On Myth and History in Prophetic and Apocalyptic Eschatology," VT 55 (2005): 412–15.

¹⁸ Cf. Bernd Janowski, "Das Doppelgesicht der Zeit: Alttestamentliche Variationen zum Thema 'Mythos und Geschichte'," in *Jewish and Christian Approaches to Psalms*, Herders Biblische Studien 57, ed. Marianne Grohmann and Yair Zakovitch (Freiburg [etc.]: Herder, 2009): 113 – 39. For comparable connections of different models of time, especially in Gen 1, cf. Ludger Schwienhorst-Schönberger, "Die Ordnung der Zeit im Alten Testament," *Jahrbuch für Biblische Theologie. Band 28 (2013): Zeit* (Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 2014): 3 – 20.

literature, the Animal Apocalypse (1 En. 85-90) and the Apocalypse of Weeks (1 En. 93:1-10: 91:11-17) are good cases in point. With regards to the Animal Apocalypse, the preservation of four Aramaic manuscripts from the Dead Sea Scrolls, of which the oldest dates back to the second half of the second century BCE, points to the second third of the second century BCE as the date of the apocalypse's origin¹⁹. The language distinguishes between different animals for mankind: wild and unclean animals for the nations and sheep for the Israelites. Stars and humans represent angels and superhuman beings. God is called the "Lord of the sheep". Within the structure of a cosmic timetable and comparable to the Apocalypse of Weeks, the world history is clearly structured into three ages. Each of them starts with a "white bull": Adam, Noah and an "eschatological" patriarch. In the end, a last judgment (1 En. 90:20 – 27) together with the construction of a "New Jerusalem" (90:28-36) leads to a total transformation. The historical retrospect is borrowing material from the biblical account and the Book of the Watchers (1 En. 1–36).²⁰

The Apocalypse of Weeks as a composite work introduces visions of heaven as they were revealed to Enoch who "read everything in the heavenly tablets" (1 En. 93:2). The text evidence embraces manuscripts in Ethiopic, Coptic and Aramaic. The latter Aramaic fragment from Cave 4 near Qumran (4QEng ar [4Q212]: mid-first century BCE) has proven the correctness of a late displacement in the Ethiopic tradition.²¹ The content of this apocalypse preserves a structured retelling of the history of the "cosmos" from an Israelite point of view. The first six "weeks" range from the primeval history to the Babylonian exile. "Weeks" eight to ten, characterized by judgment, a future temple and the building of a new heaven, are concerned with the end-time. Evidently, the seventh "week" marks the time of the real author, wherein a "perverse generation" will arise, but at its end the "chosen righteous will be chosen" (1 En. 93:9-10).²²

Reference to the linear timetable is also made in the Aramaic and Hebrew Book of Daniel. The whole of the book was written in the second third of the second century BCE. But there already existed a pre-Hellenistic collection of tales from the Persian Diaspora (Dan 1-6). The "apocalypse" consists of Dan 2 and

¹⁹ Most scholars prefer a dating between 165 and 160 BCE: cf. Patrick A. Tiller, A Commentary on the Animal Apocalypse of I Enoch, SBLEJL 4 (Atlanta, GA: Scholars Press, 1993): 61-79; George W. E. Nickelsburg, 1 Enoch 1: A Commentary on the Book of 1 Enoch, Chapters 1-36; 81-108, Hermeneia (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2001), 360-61.

²⁰ For the structure of the Animal Apocalypse cf. Tiller, *Animal Apocalypse*, 15–18.

²¹ The fragment in 4QEng ar [4Q212] that preserves 1 En. 91:11–17 follows 93:9–10. Cf. the excursus in Nickelsburg, 1 Enoch 1, 414-15.

²² Cf. Collins, *The Apocalyptic Imagination*, 62–65.

7–12. These chapters collect visions from the reign of Antiochus IV Epiphanes. Compared with texts from the Enochic lore, the Masoretic form of the Daniel apocalypticism is much more focused and gets right to the point: E.g., in Dan 12 we are told about the exact number of days until the end (Dan 12:11-12: 1,290 days and 1,335 days).²³ It is not apparent to which point in the "eschatological drama" of the Daniel apocalypse these calculations refer to: possibly to the restoration of cult at the Jerusalem temple (cf. Dan 8:14) or, what seems to be much more probable, to the starting point of a heavenly and luminous existence of the righteous (Dan 12:1-3).

Also very telling are the dream visions in Dan 2 and 7: In Dan 2 the Babylonian king Nebuchadnezzar requests that the wise men tell and interpret his dream. While the Babylonian astrologers failed on this issue, the Judean Daniel explains the dream (v. 31-35) and its interpretation (v. 36-45) to the king. The dream inaugurates a gigantic, fearsome statue consisting of a head of gold, breast and arms of silver, loins and thighs of bronze, legs of iron, feet partly of iron and partly of clay. The following interpretation, somehow in correspondence with parallel schematizations from Hesiod's Works and Days (1.109 – 201) or the Persian Zand-ī Vohūman Yasn (chap. 1), considers the structure of the statue as representing four kingdoms (Babylonia, Media, Persia and Greece).²⁴ This notion of time not only attests to a linear progression, but also implies a gradual decline. It is of special importance that the statue broke in pieces, struck by a stone that "was not cut by hands" (v. 34: hitgezæzæt 'æbæn dî-lā' bîdayin; cf. v. 35). What follows is an everlasting divine kingdom, as it is said in Dan 2:44: "And in the days of those kings, the God of Heaven ('ælāh šemayā') will erect a kingdom that will never ($le\mathring{a}lm\hat{n}$ $l\tilde{a}$) be annihilated, and the kingdom will not be left to another people. It will crush and bring to an end all those kingdoms, and it will stand forever (leålmayyā')."

In terms of time and space, the divine kingdom is totally different from all its predecessors that were crushed by the divine will. Additional information on how the linear time progresses towards its fulfillment comes from Daniel's thanksgiving hymn (v. 20 – 23). Daniel prays to the "God of Heaven" who "changes seasons and times and removes kings" (v. 21). Consequently, the series

²³ This is the only place in Jewish apocalypses where we are informed about the calculation of an end in such an exact manner: cf. John J. Collins, "From Prophecy to Apocalypticism: The Expectation of the End," in The Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism. Volume I: The Origins of Apocalypticism in Judaism and Christianity, ed. John J. Collins (New York: Continuum, 1998), 145.

²⁴ Cf. John J. Collins, Daniel: A Commentary on the Book of Daniel, Hermeneia (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1993), 162-64; Klaus Koch, Daniel. 1. Teilband: Dan 1-4, BKAT XXII/1 (Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 2005), 124-38.

of events in their temporal sequence is shaped by divine determination²⁵. Another key issue concerns the fulfillment or the end of the "historical" sequence in Daniel. In this regard, Dan 2:28-29 should be discussed:

28 But there is a God in heaven who reveals mysteries (gāle' rāzîn) and he has made known to king Nebuchadnezzar what will be at the end of days (be'aharît yômayyā').

Your dream and the vision of your head on your chaise - this is it:

29 You, king, your thoughts on your chaise went forth concerning what will be after this ('aharê denāh). The revealer of mysteries has let you know what will be.

While in v. 29 the determining end is set "after this," in v. 28 the revelation refers to "what will be at the end of days." At a quick glance, "after this" seems to refer to an inner-worldly sequence of events, while, by contrast, "at the end of days" seemingly connotes an apocalyptic eschatology that inaugurates end-time salvation.²⁶ But, even if there can be no doubt that there is an apparent redundancy between v. 28 and v. 29, both expressions, "after this" and "at the end of the days," point to "a limited period of time, that is the last of series of divinely pre-planned periods into which history is divided."27 The only difference between both expressions lies in the explicitly stated limitation of what follows beyond the present, as represented in the phrase "at the end of days." As a consequence, the terminology only illustrates that with the "end" the this-worldly timeline reaches its divinely determined conclusion. But this is not the "end of time" as such.28

²⁵ Cf. Matthias Albani, "Er bestimmt den Wechsel der Zeiten und Fristen...' Dan 2,21: Gedanken zur Zeitkonzeption in der Apokalyptik," legach 9 (2009): 21-27; Mladen Popović, "Apocalyptic Determinism," in The Oxford Handbook of Apocalyptic Literature, 255 - 70, esp. 258 - 61.

²⁶ Among many others, Reinhard Gregor Kratz, Translatio imperii: Untersuchungen zu den aramäischen Danielerzählungen und ihrem theologiegeschichtlichen Umfeld, WMANT 63 (Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 1991), 55-57, referred to this distinction in Dan 2:28-29.

²⁷ So Annette Steudel, "אחרית הימים" in the Texts from Qumran," RevQ 16 (1993): 231. Against this, Gershon Brin, The Concept of Time in the Bible and the Dead Sea Scrolls, STDJ 39 (Leiden: Brill, 2001), 149, opts for an "eschatological" understanding of the phrase. Cf. also Koch, Daniel, 113 – 14, 182 – 84, and recently Carol A. Newsom (with Brennan W. Breed), Daniel: A Commentary, OTL (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2014), 73 - 74, who suggests "in the future" or "the closing period of the future" as a translation.

²⁸ Koch, Daniel, 183, writes: "Aus diesen Texten spricht die Überzeugung, daß Zeit und Geschichte nach einer eschatologischen Kehre nicht einfach aufhören, sondern auf einer qualitativ anderen Ebene als der der uns vertrauten Tage sich fortsetzen." – Quite similar is the use of qeș in Dan 8:17, 19; 11:35 or 12:4, 6, 13.

Another example of a linear time scale with deterministic configurations is the famous vision in Dan 7. In this night-vision four beasts²⁹ represent four kingdoms, and the divine kingdom refers, not to one God as in Dan 2, but to a divine couple or "binitarian" divine structure: the one like a human being and the Ancient of Days (7:9-10, 13-14).³⁰ In Dan 7:25 one reads: "The words against the Most High he will speak, he will oppress the holy ones of the Most Highs, he will intend to change times and law, and they were given in his hand / and they were placed under his power for a time, and times, and half a time."

The adversary of the "Most High" is most probably the Seleucid king Antiochus IV Epiphanes. On some of his coins, he called himself "God Manifest," "his plotting was against the holy ones" (Dan 8:25) and "his power was mighty" (8:24; cf. also 7:8, 20). As we know from the books of Maccabees (1 Macc 1:45; 2 Macc 6:6), Antiochus changed "times and law." The phrase "for a time, and times, and half a time" is interpreted as representing three and a half years, a time span which approximately covers the period of the temple desecration in the late years of Antiochus (167–164 BCE).³¹ If this assumption proves to be correct, the timeline in Dan 7 is also limited, but simply by this-worldly events like the end of Antiochus' religious and political power.

Assuming that this is a proper interpretation of the visions in the Book of Daniel, one has to take into account the different hermeneutics of "history" in Dan 7, compared with Dan 2. While "history" in Dan 2 is reconstructed by the means of vaticinia ex eventu, Dan 7 adds a genuine prophecy to this.³² This is because the period of "a time, and times, and half a time" provides a realistic look into the author's still outstanding future: the not yet realized reinvention of the Jerusalem Temple cult.

The vision of the ram and the he-goat in Dan 8 explicitly comes back to the temple cult.33 Again, Antiochus IV Epiphanes is in focus, identified with the

²⁹ The four beasts are: a lion with wings of an eagle, a bear with three ribs in his mouth, a leopard with four wings and four heads and a fourth beast, different from all former beasts, with ten horns. There arises a little horn with eyes and a mouth (Dan 7:3-8).

³⁰ Cf. Stefan Beyerle, "Monotheism, Angelology, and Dualism in Ancient Jewish Apocalyptic Writings," in Monotheism in Late Prophetic and Early Apocalyptic Literature: Studies of the Sofja Kovalevskaja Research Group on Early Jewish Monotheism. Vol. III, FAT II/72, ed. Nathan MacDonald and Ken Brown (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2014), 236-39.

³¹ Cf. Collins, Daniel, 321-22. Cf. also Newsom, Daniel, 240-41, who, furthermore, explains rather critically alternative understandings of the king's changing of "times and law", e.g., as a reference to calendaric changes.

³² Cf. Collins, Daniel, 322.

³³ Cf. Stefan Beyerle, "Die apokalyptische Vision in Daniel 8," in Apokalyptik in Antike und Aufklärung, Studien zu Judentum und Christentum, ed. Jürgen Brokoff and Bernd Schipper (Pader-

"small horn" from the he-goat (8:8-9). In Dan 8:13-14, Antiochus' desecration of the temple cult is explained:

13 And I heard a certain holy one speaking, and a certain holy one said to whoever it was who was speaking: For how long is the vision of the Tamid (daily offering) and the desolating transgression; he gives over: holy/sanctuary and host to be trampled?

14 He said to me (versions: to him): For two thousand three hundred evenings and mornings, until the holy/sanctuary is set right.

Again, the desecration and the – still expected – reinvention of the sanctuary, the temple, lie at the heart of the text. Again, a chronological limitation is given that covers slightly less than three and a half years. ³⁴ Again, the historical circumstances of the so-called "Syrian Crisis" under Antiochus provide the historical background. But compared with Dan 7, chapter 8 goes further in that it explicitly refers to the daily offering (cf. Exod 29:38-42; Num 28:2-8). Consequently, the linear notion of time that awaits Antiochus' defeat and the reinvention of the sanctuary appear as mingled with a cyclic timescale, as represented in the daily offerings. In short, Dan 8 provides a cyclic concept of time for the "eschaton" by means of a cultic setting. E.g., the collection of "Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice" from the Dead Sea Scrolls is in some respects comparable to this notion of time.

Finally, besides all cultic allusions, a cyclic notion of time results from the historical provenance or setting of ancient Jewish apocalypses. Most documents refer to a religio-political crisis that caused resistance. ³⁵ E.g., the later visions in the Book of Daniel, the Animal Apocalypse and the Apocalypse of Weeks were written in the middle of the second century BCE relating to the desecration of the Jerusalem Temple and the Maccabean rebellion. The books of 4 Ezra and 2 Baruch, also the Book of Revelation, date back to the late first or early second century CE relating to the Roman oppressions under the Flavian dynasty. Both apocalypses deal with the Roman siege and destruction of Jerusalem and the

born: Ferdinand Schöningh, 2004): 25-44; André Bohnet, "Kultbezüge im Danielbuch," BN N.F. 160 (2014): 37-49.

³⁴ Cf. Collins, Daniel, 336. Cf. also Newsom, Daniel, 256-58, 266-68. For an overview concerning the conceptualizations of "the end" in the Book of Daniel see also John J. Collins, "The Meaning of 'The End' in the Book of Daniel," in Of Scribes and Scrolls: Studies on the Hebrew Bible, Intertestamental Judaism and Christian Origins, ed. Harold W. Attridge, John J. Collins and Thomas Tobin (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1990): 91-98, reprinted in idem, Seers, Sibyls and Sages in Hellenistic-Roman Judaism (Boston-Leiden: Brill, 2001): 157-65.

³⁵ Cf. Anathea E. Portier-Young, Apocalypse against Empire: Theologies of Resistance in Early Judaism (Grand Rapids-Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2011).

Temple on Mount Zion in the first Jewish war (66-70 CE). Furthermore, the "historical apocalypses" used prominent topics, as "Exodus" or "Exile," to implement their idea of a recurring scheme of "apostasy and punishment" within their hermeneutics. Consequently, both, the need for a re-calculation of the "end" and the reappearance of well-known patterns from the Jewish history, point to another aspect of a cyclic timetable.

To draw some preliminary conclusions: already the genre – "apocalypse" – emphasizes the linear aspect of time, when historical reflections constitute the core criteria in the so-called "historical apocalypses" (cf. Dan 2; 7–12; *1 En.* 85–90; *1 En.* 93:1–10; 91:11–17; *4 Ezra*; *2 Bar.* or *Jub.* 23). "History" in its apocalyptic setting is furthermore used to construct a gap between time and times in this-worldly and otherworldly spheres.³⁸ Beyond every linear notion of time, apocalypses also embrace to some extent thoughts of a cyclic concept of time.

4 Notions of "Space" and "Apocalyptic Eschatology"

When it comes to the question of "space" within apocalyptic literature, the separation of heaven and earth forms the core background for almost all specified ideas of an afterlife.³⁹ The most prominent concepts include: the kingdom of God, as, e.g., in the Book of Daniel, resurrection, as, e.g., also in Daniel (Dan 12:1–3) or in the *Epistle of Enoch* (1 En. 102–104) and the Dead Sea Scrolls (4Q385; 4Q521), the immortality of the soul, as, e.g., in the Wisdom of Solomon, a new heaven or new creation, as, e.g., in the *Apocalypse of Weeks* or *4 Ezra* and

³⁶ Cf. Collins, The Apocalyptic Imagination, 195–96, 212–13.

³⁷ Cf. Beyerle, "'Remember the Exodus!'", 215–25; Michael A. Knibb, "The Exile in the Literature of the Intertestamental Period," *HeyJ* 17 (1976): 253–72, reprinted in *idem*, *Essays on the Book of Enoch and Other Early Jewish Texts and Traditions*, SVTP 22 (Leiden-Boston: Brill, 2009), 191–212.

³⁸ Cf., among others, Hans Weder, "Die Verflüchtigung der Gegenwart: Neutestamentliche Anmerkungen zur apokalyptischen Zeitstimmung,", in *In Erwartung eines Endes: Apokalyptik und Geschichte*, Theophil 7, ed. Helmut Holzhey and Georg Kohler (Zürich: Pano Verlag, 2001): 53 – 67. **39** In terms of resurrection cf. the overview of John J. Collins, "The Afterlife in Apocalyptic Literature," in *Judaism in Late Antiquity. Part 4: Death, Life-After-Death, Resurrection and the World-to-Come in the Judaisms of Antiquity*, Handbuch der Orientalistik I,49,4, ed. Alan J. Avery-Peck and Jacob Neusner (Leiden: Brill, 2000): 119 – 39, reprinted in *Apocalypse, Prophecy, and Pseudepigraphy*, 198 – 216.

2 Baruch, a heavenly city or temple, as, e.g., in 4 Ezra and the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice - just to list a few.

Another very specific and also telling idea of an "eschatological space" that is especially attested in the Dead Sea Scrolls points to an angel-like existence in the communion of the elected people. This eschatological concept embraces more than a separated - not to say sectarian - religious identity among those groups that were involved in the writing and authorization of the Dead Sea Scrolls. Far beyond this, members of this angel-like community felt they belong to a divine community. The keyword for an appropriate characterization of this community could be "mystic union."

More than ten years ago, Bilha Nitzan and Elliot Wolfson discussed the appropriate application of criteria for "mysticism" within the interpretation of poetical texts from the Dead Sea. While Nitzan differentiated between a "Celestial" (only to be found in the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice) and "Communionist Approach" (to be found in prayers like the Hodayot), Wolfson challenged Nitzan's bi-focal interpretation and preferred to collapse both approaches into one, pointing out that the taxonomy of "mysticism" refers mainly to an "ontic transformation" implied by participation – the so-called *unio mystica*. Albeit there is no throne scene attested in the known fragments of the Hodayot,41 the "eschatology" of some prayers from the Dead Sea Scrolls clearly presupposes a transformation and, conclusively, an identification of the praying community with heavenly beings or angels. A good case in point is 1QH 11:22 – 24:⁴²

22. And a perverted spirit you have purified from great sin that it might take its place with 23. the host of the holy ones and enter into community with the congregation of the children of heaven (lhtysb bm'md 'm sb' adwšyn wlbw' byhd 'm 'dt bny šmym). And you cast for the man an eternal lot with the spirits 24. of knowledge, that he might praise your name in a common rejoicing and recount your wonderful acts before all your works.

As Elliot Wolfson argued extensively, the lot of those who are among the "children of heaven" is closely connected with the ability to approach divine knowl-

⁴⁰ Cf. Bilha Nitzan, "Harmonic and Mystical Characteristics in Poetic and Liturgical Writings from Qumran," JQR 85 (1994), 166-68; Elliot R. Wolfson, "Mysticism and Poetic-Liturgical Compositions from Qumran: A Response to Bilha Nitzan," JQR 85 (1994), 187-88, 193-94.

⁴¹ The "thrice-told" or "self-glorification hymn" in 4Q427, 4Q471b and 4Q491 that attests a throne scene in combination with the ascent motif is, undoubtedly, exceptional among the Hodayot: cf. John J. Collins and Devorah Dimant, "A Thrice-Told Hymn: A Response to Eileen Schuller," *IOR* 85 (1994): 151–55.

⁴² For the text, transcription and translation cf. Hartmut Stegemann, Eileen Schuller and Carol Newsom, 1QHodayot^a, DJD XL (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2009), pl. IX, 145, 155.

edge by means of the "spirits of knowledge." The angelic sphere, as it is conceptualized in the passage quoted above, includes an "ontic" dimension. ⁴³ Although the following passage in 1QH 11:25–26 underlines the lowliness of human nature, this statement does not constitute a contradiction to the concept of "angelization": because the boundaries between the divine – or heavenly – and the human worlds have been blurred. ⁴⁴ Nevertheless, the heavenly status, as an "ontic" quality, cannot be achieved automatically. Rather, "angelization" is the final goal of a longer process and transformation. ⁴⁵ Two further passages from the *Hodayot* point to this process (1QH 19:12–15 and 1QH 20:14–16): ⁴⁶

[1QH 19] 12. For you have made known to them the secret counsel of your truth (*ky hwd'tm bswd 'mtkh*), 13. and given them insight into your wonderful mysteries (*wbrzy pl'kh hskltm*). For the sake of your glory you have purified mortal from sin so that he may sanctify himself 14. for you from all impure abominations and from faithless guilt, so that he might be united with the children of your truth and in the lot with 15. your holy ones (*lhwhd 'm bny 'mtk wbgwrl 'm qdwsykh*).

[1QH 20] 14. And I, the Instructor, I know you, my God, by the spirit (*brwh*) 15. that you have placed in me. Faithfully have I heeded your wondrous secret counsel (*wn'mnh šm'ty lswd pl'kh*). By your holy spirit 16. you have [o]pened up knowledge within me through the mystery of your wisdom and the fountainhead of your pow[er] ([p]tḥth ltwky d't brz sklkh wm'wn gbwrt[kh).

Elliot Wolfson correctly refers to the second passage as an extremely important text that hints to a specific ecstatic experience of a priestly acquiring of divine knowledge.⁴⁷ This experience is part of a process. The same process of acquisition of divine knowledge had been initiated by "rituals" of purification and redemption, as it becomes apparent especially in the quoted prayer of 1QH 19.⁴⁸ At the end of the process the person, gaining the wisdom regarding the mystery,

⁴³ Cf. Elliot R. Wolfson, "Seven Mysteries of Knowledge: Qumran E/Sotericism Recovered," in *The Idea of Biblical Interpretation: Essays in Honor of James L. Kugel*, JSJSup 83, ed. Hindy Najman and Judith H. Newman (Leiden: Brill, 2004): 206–13.

⁴⁴ Cf. Wolfson, "Seven Mysteries of Knowledge," 196.

⁴⁵ Cf. Benjamin L. Gladd, *Revealing the* Mysterion: *The Use of* Mystery *in Daniel and Second Temple Judaism with Its Bearing on First Corinthians*, BZNW 160 (Berlin-New York: W. de Gruyter, 2008), 65–69, who refers to the "Adamic" transformation and the "Teacher of Righteousness" role of instruction in the *Hodayot*.

⁴⁶ For the text, transcription and translation cf. Stegemann, Schuller and Newsom, *1QHodayot*^a, pl. XVII – XVIII, 240, 248, 250, 259 – 60.

⁴⁷ Cf. Wolfson, "Seven Mysteries of Knowledge," 201.

⁴⁸ To my view, the all too hasty identification of an instructor with the "Qumran Teacher of Righteousness" should be avoided: but see Markus N.A. Bockmuehl, *Revelation and Mystery in Ancient Judaism and Pauline Christianity*, WUNT II/36 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1990), 49 – 50.

has approached God's holy dwelling (1QH 11:35-37). Consequently the arrangement of motifs covers several cosmic allusions to apocalyptic otherworldly concepts (e.g., in the Book of 1 Enoch).⁴⁹

Concerning the topic, the wisdom text of 4QInstruction is characterized by a number of specific features: unlike the *Hodayot*, 4QInstruction is not considered a sectarian composition. Furthermore, to my knowledge, the preserved fragments of 40Instruction do not provide evidence to an elaborated concept of "angelization," as attested in the Hodayot or the Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice. 50 Finally, the semantic range and use of "mystery", with regards to the rz nhyh, has not been sufficiently clarified yet.

With a view to the latter problem, the rz nhyh, attested more than twenty times in the preserved fragments, in its terminology generally points to the deterministic aspect in the text. The second part of the term represents a Niph'al participle from hyh. Most interpreters translate "mystery that is to be/come" or "mystery of existence" and assume the entire range of chronological spheres: past, present and future, with a slight emphasis on the future aspect.⁵¹ Recent philological insights lead to further specifications: the morphology clearly hints at a Niph'al form, and the Niph'al is not simply a passive stem compared to the Qal, but reflects on the progress of an indicated process. It emphasizes the incidence and manifestation of what happens with a view to the subject. "With reference to situations which are in fact future, the participle may denote merely a circumstance accompanying a future event [...]."52 Therefore, the Niph'al participle in rz nhyh denotes a "futurum instans". In conclusion, I would suggest the translation "mystery that is in the process of taking place" for rz nhyh.⁵³

Already the orientation towards the future in the term *rz nhyh*, as it comes apparent if philology and semantics are considered, emphasizes the processlike aspect of "learning" in 4QInstruction. But certainly, the sources are more

⁴⁹ Cf. Angela Kim Harkins, Reading with an "I" to the Heavens: Looking at the Qumran Hodayot through the Lens of Visionary Traditions, Ekstasis 3 (Berlin-Boston: W. de Gruyter, 2012), 141-47. For the functions of blessing in the composition of the Hodayot as marks of spatial movements into the heavenly realm cf. eadem, Reading with an "I" to the Heavens, 247-65.

⁵⁰ Rather it seems that, e.g., in 4Q416 1.10 – 12, the term "sons of heaven" presupposes, as a part of a dualistic expression, the concept of "angelization." The text does not set up the concept. 51 Cf. Matthew J. Goff, The Worldly and Heavenly Wisdom of 4QInstruction, STDJ 50 (Leiden: Brill, 2003), 30-79.

⁵² Quotation in: Bruce K. Waltke and Michael O'Connor, An Introduction to Biblical Hebrew Syntax (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1990), 627, § 37.6 f (italics in the text).

⁵³ Cf. Beyerle, "Monotheism", 232-33.

telling. With a view to the argument, it suffices to refer to 4Q417 1 i (formally 2 i) 6-9 (with 4Q418 43 4-7):⁵⁴

6. By day and by night meditate upon the mystery that is in process of taking place, and study continually. And then you shall know truth and iniquity, wisdom 7. and foolishness you shall recognize (ywmm wlylh hgh brz nhyh wdwrš tmyd w'z td' 'mt w'wl ḥkmh w'wlt), every act in all their ways, together with their punishments in all ages everlasting, and the punishment 8. of eternity. Then you shall discern between the good and evil according to their deeds. For the God of knowledge is the foundation of truth. And by the mystery that is in process of taking place 9. He has laid out its foundation.

The learning one shall "meditate" (Hebr. hgh; cf. Ps 1:2; 37:30) upon the "mystery" in order to approach the "truth" that was originally part of the divine foundation. The "mystery" appears here in a wisdom-like context, wherein wisdom functions on an instrumental level, as part of the creation process (cf. also Prov 8:22-31). Also the "meditation" is part of a development, as it brings the searcher closer to God. This process is conceptualized, concerning the semantics of "wisdom," on three different levels: First, there is craftsmanship, i.e., a rather technical use of wisdom (cf. "wisdom of hands": cf. 4Q418 102 3-4). Second, a religious dimension of "wisdom" comes into view, insofar as God has created the cosmos with "mystery" (4Q417 1 i 8-9), and nothing exists beyond the divine will (cf. 4Q418 126 i-ii 5). Third and finally, the "eschatological" dimension becomes obvious. In 4Q417 1 i (formally 2 i) 8 we read: "Then you shall discern between the good and evil according to their deeds. For the God of knowledge is the foundation of truth". The dualism of "good" and "evil" is established within the creation myth (cf. Gen 2:9, 17; 3:5, 22; Job 30:26; Prov 31:12). But in 4QInstruction the same dualism is also integrated into sceneries of a divine judgment at the end of time (cf. 4Q416 1 10-16; 4Q417 2 i 13-16; 4Q418 69 i-ii 5-9).55 Here, "creation" and "eschatology" are closely interlinked. Furthermore, wisdom knowledge is associated with the mystery that is in the process of taking place (rz nhyh). This "mystery" has an especially important role to play because of its function within divine revelation (cf. 4Q416 2 iii 17 f; 4Q418 123 i-ii 4 f; 4Q423 1 4).

⁵⁴ For the text, transcription and translation cf. John Strugnell and Daniel J. Harrington, *Qumran Cave 4. XXIV. Sapiential Texts, Part 2: 4QInstruction (Mûsār Lĕ Mēvîn): 4Q415ff.*, DJD 34 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999, repr. 2007), pl. VIII, XV, 151, 154, 255 (deviations in the translation are mine).

⁵⁵ For the discussion on "eschatologized wisdom" cf. Matthew J. Goff, *Discerning Wisdom: The Sapiential Literature of the Dead Sea Scrolls*, VTS 116 (Leiden: Brill, 2007), 32–36.

5 Conclusion

In his seminal book on a "theology" of apocalypticism, Ulrich H. J. Körtner frequently used the German word "*Angst*" ("fear") to explain what he called a "*ursprüngliche Welt- und Daseinserschließung*" in the context of apocalypticism. ⁵⁶ He writes: "As we said, the end of the world in Jewish apocalypticism is definite, insofar as it entails a final decision. It is judgment, crisis [i.e., decision; SB] and therein both, termination and new beginning. Once again, this reflects the transformation of '*Weltangst*' in Jewish apocalypticism from a fear [i.e., '*Angst*'; SB] of catastrophe into a fear of crisis."

Apocalypticism involves a progress from catastrophe towards crisis. Already historical settings of apocalypses in Hellenistic-Roman times appeared to refer to a time of "crisis" in the eyes of the authors. Whether it was perceived as the end of religious life for some Jewish groups in the context of the desecration and destruction of the Jerusalem Temple, or "crisis" simply marked another inner-Jewish conflict within different groups, e.g., of the Dead Sea Scrolls movement. All in all, there was "crisis from the outside," or "crisis without," and "crisis within" in the Jewish communities of the last two centuries before the Common Era. Both examples from the Dead Sea Scrolls, the *Hodayot* and the wisdom text (4QInstruction), explain such a "crisis without" and a "crisis within": whereas the *Hodayot* indicate an in-group struggle among the members of the Dead Sea Scrolls movement, the eschatological wisdom composition of 4QInstruction highlights a conflict outside the sectarian groups in learned wisdom traditions.

⁵⁶ So Ulrich H. J. Körtner, *Weltangst und Weltende: Eine theologische Interpretation der Apokalyptik* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1988), 138.

⁵⁷ So Körtner, *Weltangst*, 191. Translation is mine. The German text reads: "Definitiv, so sagten wir, ist das Weltende in der jüdischen Apokalyptik, insofern es eine einmalige Entscheidung herbeiführt. Es ist Gericht, Krisis, darin Abbruch ebenso wie auch Neuanfang. Hierin spiegelt sich noch einmal die Wandlung der Weltangst in der jüdischen Apokalyptik von der Katastrophenangst zur Krisenangst."

⁵⁸ Cf. Beate Ego, "The Hellenistic Crisis as Reflected by the *Animal Apocalypse*: Aetiological and Eschatological Aspects," in *Judaism and Crisis: Crisis as a Catalyst in Jewish Cultural History*, Schriften des Institutum Judaicum Delitzschianum 9, ed. Armin Lange, K.F. Diethard Römheld and Matthias Weigold (Göttingen-Oakville, CT: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2011): 75–87: who focuses on the Antiochean crisis in light of the *Animal Apocalypse* and emphasizes correctly that in this apocalypse the "interpretation of crisis merges into its overcoming," since the text post-dates the reinvention of the Jerusalem Temple in 165/164 BCE. On the Dead Sea Scrolls cf. George J. Brooke, "Crisis Without, Crisis Within: Changes and Developments within the Dead Sea Scrolls Movement," in *Judaism and Crisis*, 89–107.

⁵⁹ On the terminology cf. Brooke, "Crisis Without," 96–106.

Whereas the "space" of the "congregation of the children of heaven" (10H 11:23) is unambiguously otherworldly, the wisdom text only addresses a process, wherein the "learning one" approaches the divine by means of "meditation of the mystery that is in process of taking place" (40417 1 i 6). The concept of "space" within apocalyptic eschatology in those sources uniquely points to a transformation, which is characterized by different qualities of their processbased aspects.

In his quotation, Körtner, furthermore, parallels judgment, crisis, termination or annihilation and a new beginning. With the latter, notions of time in apocalyptic eschatology are concerned. In general, linear and cyclic models of time are presupposed and processed in Jewish apocalypses, albeit the linear orientation of time dominates. What sets Körtner apart, are oppositions. Judgment, crisis and termination are the pseudo-historical ingredients of a divinely determined process. "History," so to speak, is part of divine revelation. As a consequence, terms like "the end of days" or "the end" and "the thereafter" do not imply the end of the world at all. Rather, all of "history" in the apocalypses of the Enochic and Danielic traditions should be understood in light of an ending that embraces a new beginning. This is already evident in the metaphorical codifications that apocalypses like the Animal Apocalypse or the Book of Daniel introduced.⁶⁰ Furthermore, the earthly kingdoms that will be annihilated are contrasted with the kingdom of the "God of Heaven" that will stand forever, as it is apparent from the Book of Daniel (cf. 2:44: see above). God has set up a date to which all history will reach its goal. What will follow is the "new beginning."

Ancient Jewish apocalypticism used various motifs, models and structures like resurrection, new creation, heavenly realms or luminous immortality to envision this "new beginning." From Paul Auster's point of view it suffices to finish with a promise: "Once we get to where we are going, I will try to write to you again, I promise."61

⁶⁰ Cf. Stefan Beyerle, "Leben in Metaphern: Aspekte einer metaphorischen Realität in der Apokalyptik," in Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Yearbook 2014/2015: The Metaphorical Use of Language in Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature, ed. Markus Witte and Sven Behnke (Berlin-Munich-Boston: W. de Gruyter, 2015): 355-80.

⁶¹ Auster, Country, 188.